(Former) YALE CLUB of NEW YORK CITY BUILDING (now PENN CLUB of NEW YORK), 30-32 West 44th Street, Manhattan

Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 54

On November 17, 2009, the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation as a Landmark of the (former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York) and the proposed designation of the related Landmark Site (Item No.1). The hearing had been duly advertised in accordance with the provisions of law. Four people spoke in favor of designation, including representatives of the Penn Club, University of Pennsylvania, New York Assemblyman Richard Gottfried, and Historic Districts Council.

Summary
The former Yale Club of New York City Building is located along “clubhouse row,” West 44th Street between Fifth and Sixth Avenues, its neighbors including the Harvard Club, New York Yacht Club, Association of the Bar of the City of New York, and former City Club. This Beaux-Arts style building, constructed in 1900-01 by builder Marc Eidlitz & Son, was designed by [Evarts] Tracy & [Egerton] Swartwout, both Yale University graduates, Yale Club members, and former employees of McKim, Mead & White. It was one of the first high-rise clubhouse buildings in the city, with over half the floors devoted to bachelor apartments, during the era when bachelor apartment hotels were a necessity in the vicinity. The original 11-story, 50-foot-wide front façade features a double-story rusticated limestone base and red brick cladding laid in Flemish bond (with glazed headers) above, balconies, a profusion of terra-cotta ornament (manufactured by the New York Architectural Terra Cotta Co.), and an oversized arch surmounted by a cartouche above the widely-projecting bracketed copper cornice. Its tripartite composition reflected the original internal organization: club rooms on the lower stories, bachelor apartments in the middle section, and upper club dining rooms and service area. Organized in 1897, the Yale Club of New York City remained here until 1915, when it moved to a larger facility two blocks east. This structure was next owned (1916-25) by Delta Kappa Epsilon, a fraternity founded at Yale, and used as a club and headquarters. The Army & Navy Club of America was located here from 1925 until its bankruptcy in 1933. The building remained vacant until it was acquired by the U.S. Government in 1943; it served as the Maritime Service Center during World War II, and after 1948 as headquarters of the U.S. Army Organized Reserve Corps. It was donated as “surplus property” to Touro College in 1971. Acquired by the Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania in 1989, this has been the home since 1994 of the Penn Club of New York, which added three upper stories by [David P.] Helpern Architects.
DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS

The Development of the Clubhouse District: West 43rd and 44th Streets in Midtown Manhattan

In the late 19th century, a men’s clubhouse district developed in midtown Manhattan, centered along West 43rd and 44th Streets between Fifth and Sixth Avenues. Social clubs for men had been organized in New York City ever since the 1830s, largely modeled after those in London, and were formed along lines such as social class, politics, ethnicity, business, sports, or other shared interests. By the end of the 19th century, New York had over one hundred men’s clubs (second only to London), many catering particularly to young bachelors and providing alternative options for living, dining and drinking, and socializing outside of boardinghouses or restaurants. The Harvard Alumni Association was the first of the university clubs in New York, founded in 1865 (and incorporated as the Harvard Club in 1887), followed by the University Club organized the same year, and the Princeton Alumni Association in 1875 (which became the Princeton Club in 1899). Most clubs were established in former rowhouses and mansions, in areas such as Madison Square and Gramercy Park – as late as the early 1890s, clubhouse architecture per se was virtually unknown in New York.

The Union League Club (1881, Peabody & Stearns; demolished), Fifth Avenue and 39th Street, is considered the city’s first purpose-built clubhouse, located just south of what became the clubhouse district. 43rd and 44th Streets west of Fifth Avenue were at the time dominated by stables, rather than the rowhouses that were being constructed in the vicinity, which depressed land values on those blocks. After the removal of the Croton reservoir for the construction of the New York Public Library (1898-1911, Carrere & Hastings), Fifth Avenue and 42nd Street, however, adjacent streets began to take on a new character. West 44th Street was developed with clubs, institutions, and residential hotels, including: the Berkeley Athletic Club (1887-88, demolished), the street’s first club, at No. 23; Brearley School (1890, Henry R. Marshall; demolished), No. 9: Berkeley School (later General Society of Mechanics and Tradesmen) (1890, Lamb & Rich; 1903-05, Ralph S. Townsend), No. 20; Harvard Club (1893-94, McKim, Mead & White), No. 27; St. Nicholas Club (1893-94, George E. Wood; demolished), No. 7; Association of the Bar of the City of New York (1895-96, Cyrus L.W. Eidlitz), No. 42; Delmonico’s restaurant (1897, James Brown Lord; demolished), Fifth Avenue and 44th Street; New York Yacht Club (1899-1900, Warren & Wetmore), No. 37; Yale Club of New York City (1900-01, Tracy & Swartwout), No. 30-32; the Mansfield (1901-03, Renwick, Aspinwall & Owens), a bachelor apartment hotel, No. 12-14; Lambs Club (1904-05, McKim, Mead & White), No. 128; the Iroquois (1903, Harry B. Mulliken), an apartment hotel, No. 49-53; Algonquin Hotel (1902, Goldwin Starrett), No. 59-61; City Club (1902-04, Lord & Hewlett), No. 55-57; Alpha Delta Phi Club (1905-07, Louis Brown and Palmer & Hornbostel), No. 136; and Phi Gamma Delta Club, No. 44 (after 1908 at No. 34). On West 43rd Street were the New York Academy of Medicine (1889, R.H. Robertson; demolished), No. 19; Century Association (1889-91, McKim, Mead & White), No. 7; Racquet & Tennis Club (1890-91, Cyrus L.W. Eidlitz; demolished), No. 27; Hotel Renaissance (1890-91, Clarence Luce), a residential/bachelor apartment hotel (after 1916 the Columbia University Club), No. 4; Hotel Royalton (1897, Rossiter & Wright), No. 47; and Elks Club (1909, J. Riely Gordon), No. 108-116.
The Bachelor Apartment Hotel or “Bachelor Flats”

A development that paralleled the creation of the clubhouse district in New York was the emergence of a distinct residential building type for men: the bachelor apartment hotel, or “bachelor flats.” Throughout the 19th century, large numbers of New Yorkers lived in multiple residences, including converted dwellings and hotels, due (among other factors) to real estate conditions that made single-family residences prohibitive to all but the wealthy. The bachelor apartment hotel was a variation on one of the purpose-built multiple dwelling building types that emerged in New York City in the early 1870s (and in such cities as Boston, Washington, and Chicago in the 1870s-80s). Though the contemporary terms were sometimes employed imprecisely, the building types came to be defined as: 1) the apartment house or French flats consisted of apartments with suites of rooms (including a bathroom and kitchen) for middle- and upper-middle-class residents (luxury apartment houses emerged after 1880); 2) the apartment hotel or residential hotel had apartments, for basically long-term residents, with suites of rooms (including a bathroom but no kitchen), while a dining room and other services were provided; and 3) the hotel, for transient visitors and long-term residents, had a variety of services, as well as a dining room open to the general public.

With the growth and industrialization of New York in the 19th century, the work force consisted of very large numbers of unmarried men. The number of bachelors in the city ranged from 125,000 (about 13% of the total population) in 1870,5 to nearly 45 percent of the male population over the age of 15 in 1890.6 Howard Chudacoff, in a study on the “bachelor subculture in America” from 1880 to 1930, identified 1890 as the peak year in American history of the number of unmarried males over the age of 15 – nearly 42 percent was the national average.7 He and other historians have noted a variety of contemporary social factors that contributed to the numbers of single men: the exclusion of women from most occupations; the greater number of male immigrants; postponement of marriage due to low income level; dissatisfaction with the institution of marriage; and the availability of alternatives, including socializing outside of marriage, the emergence of a gay male community, and the attractions of the heterosexual “sporting male culture.”8

Housing options for middle-class unmarried men in New York were severely limited. As rowhouses and better hotels were expensive, bachelors were forced to find quarters in boarding or rooming houses (usually converted rowhouses) with less privacy or security; in less-than-desirable rooms in cheaper hotels or apartment buildings; or in such facilities as clubs and YMCAs. It was observed in 1898 that “the bachelor was not considered to be entitled to much consideration; any old thing was good enough for him... Anyone who was old enough and had the means to marry and yet did not, was not thought to be entitled to anything better.”9 The apartment hotel provided an alternative that could accommodate unmarried men along with couples, families, and widows, but this was considered awkward as single men were seen as threatening to married couples and traditional gender roles. Chudacoff comments that:

Americans have always revered and depended on the family as the chief institution for promoting citizenship and social order. They have celebrated family life as a basic stabilizing influence in society. Those who valued the family in this way considered individuals and groups living outside the family setting as outcasts, people handicapped by an inability to participate in wholesome social life. These individuals were said to be destabilizing influences...10
The acute need for New York apartment hotels specifically for bachelors was reported by architect Emlen T. Littel in a paper read before the annual convention of the American Institute of Architects and published in 1876. He called for the construction of “club chambers, arranged for the special use of bachelors, [in which they] would find a permanent and real home.” Littel concluded that “of single men, young and old... there is nothing which would conduce more to their welfare than the erection of such buildings; and, further, that there are few investments in real estate which would so amply reward the proprietor.”

The first American apartment hotel is believed to have been the Hotel Pelham (1856-57, Alfred Stone of Arthur Gilman’s firm) in Boston. In New York, the proliferation of French flats is usually traced to the success of the Stuyvesant Apartments (1869-70, Richard Morris Hunt; demolished), 142 East 18th Street, which attracted a “respectable” clientele, while one of the city’s earliest apartment hotels was the Grosvenor House (1871-72, Detlef Lienau; demolished), 35-37 Fifth Avenue. Stevens House (1870-72, Richard Morris Hunt; demolished), Broadway and 27th Street, was originally built with apartments, but the building was remodeled and enlarged in 1873-74 (Arthur Gilman, architect) as an apartment hotel, and it has been suggested that it also then became one of the first bachelor apartment hotels in New York. The Panic of 1873 slowed the construction of apartment hotels until economic recovery occurred around 1879-80. Among the early purpose-built bachelor flats were the Benedick (1879-80, McKim, Mead & Bigelow), 79-80 Washington Square East; the Percival (1882, McKim, Mead & White; demolished), 230 West 42nd Street; Gorham Building (1883-84, Edward H. Kendall), 889-891 Broadway; and the Alpine (1886-87, D. & J. Jardine; demolished), 1284 Broadway. Between 1880 and 1915, hundreds of bachelor apartment hotels were erected. The Real Estate Record & Builders Guide in 1890 reflected that

the bachelors’ apartment house is a product of our modern life. It is not a social fad, ready to disappear directly. It has ceased to be a novelty. It has come to stay, for it fills a gap in the life of every unmarried man who has become weary of the boarding house, the furnished room, or the hotel.

Historian Paul Groth noted that the success of American residential hotels, including bachelor flats,

made possible a cultured, civilized life for men without the aid of a woman... provid[ing] domestic care as well as, or better than, a woman could. In some cases, then, the maxim “What every man needs is a good woman,” became “What every man needs is a good hotel.”

The Record & Guide commented in 1898 that bachelor flats “began to arise one after the other, and each later one surpassing its predecessor in elegance, comfort and convenience,” and by 1905 noted that “such buildings are found for the most part along Fifth Avenue south of Central Park, and in the cross streets adjacent, on Broadway, and in some other choice locations” south to 23rd Street.

The Yale Club of New York City

Yale University alumni were among the most numerous constituents of the University Club, when it was organized under that name in 1865. The Yale Alumni Association of New York, established in 1868, was succeeded in 1897 by the Yale Club of New York City, which occupied
the former Lambs Club’s rowhouse at 17 East 26th Street, facing Madison Square. Within just a few years, with a rapid increase in membership (which doubled to over 1,100), the club sought without success to purchase a building within the clubhouse district. In February 1900, a special meeting was called at which time the club voted to purchase a site at 30-32 West 44th Street. Architects Evarts Tracy and Egerton Swartwout, both Yale graduates, Yale Club members, and former employees of McKim, Mead & White, had already developed preliminary plans for a new building. The overall scheme was for the building to be constructed and owned by the Yale Building Co., an entity composed of club members, which would rent space to the Yale Club. Income from both the restaurants and bachelor apartments in the structure would eventually retire the building company’s shares, so that the Club would own the property, subject to the mortgage. By May 1900, the two lots were acquired from Isidore and Bertha Jackson and Abraham Stern for around $110,000. Building plans were filed in July, and construction began by general contractor Marc Eidlitz & Son in October, at which time a rendering of the building appeared in the *Brooklyn Daily Eagle*. The *Yale Alumni Weekly* stated the club’s purposes:

> to provide at low cost a club for daily use, more especially for the younger graduates; to afford opportunity for class dinners and other special gatherings of Yale men from time to time; to do for Yale and Yale men what was done by the association by holding frequent meetings or club nights to bring the alumni together for enlightenment, discussion, entertainment and social pleasure, and by these means and through its committee on the university to bring the alumni and the university into closer touch.

The Yale Club of New York City Building was one of the first high-rise clubhouses in the city, with over half of the floors devoted to bachelor apartments (most leased annually). The *Brooklyn Daily Eagle* noted that “several upper floors are to be taken up with sleeping rooms for members, this feature being deemed a wise means of meeting the expenses of the new building, until such time as the club desires to occupy more of it for strictly club purposes,” while the *New-York Tribune* reported that “while nearly all clubs are built for the accommodation of the members as a body, this one is devoted for the most part to sleeping apartments, which take up six of the eleven floors.” The *New Haven Evening Register* commented at length:

> It is not a novel enterprise, this of providing bachelors of large or moderate means with “all the comforts of home” in a building restricted to male tenants, such as the Yale club proposes... The erection of modern fireproof bachelor apartments is, however, a new form of building investment; one that pays well, that has not been overdone, and one that provides an avenue for capital which should attract investors ... The location of a building which is to cater to bachelors is of the utmost importance. ... The structure must be within easy walking distance of the clubs, the theaters, and the popular restaurants and cafes; moreover, it must be very accessible to the business districts... These requirements are well met, of course, by what is known as the “club center,” or the section between Fifth and Sixth Avenues on Forty-Third and Forty-Fourth Streets.  

It was later observed in *New York 1900* that “tower clubhouses, built with floors of bedrooms sandwiched between club rooms and aerial dining rooms, were particularly appropriate for large social organizations that were less exclusive than the Union or Metropolitan clubs.” Other
examples included the Republican Club (1900, York & Sawyer), 56 West 40th Street; New York Club (1906, Henry J. Hardenbergh; demolished), 20 West 40th Street; and Engineers Club (1906, Whitfield & King), 32 West 40th Street.

Formally opened in May 1901, at a total cost of $375,000, the Beaux-Arts style Yale Club of New York City Building was very well received in the popular and architectural press. The *New York Times* called it “one of the best appointed in the city. Not a convenience is lacking...,”25 while the English publication *The Junior Munsey* commented that “the imposing new home of the Yale Club... has opened the eyes of the public to the tremendous strides the college organizations have made in New York in the last few years, and has aroused comments upon the place these clubs fill in the varied social life of a big city,” noting that, of the more than 35 college and fraternity clubs in the city, only Harvard, Yale, and Princeton “maintain[ed] fully equipped club houses in New York... [which] compare with the first establishments of the kind in the country.” It further praised the Yale Club building:

> It is the new home of the Yale Club, however, that makes one marvel at the prosperity of the college organizations. This eleven story building represents an outlay of three hundred and seventy five thousand dollars. It is a very handsome structure, and admirably suited to the needs of the club. ... The architects, both young Yale men, have succeeded in adding a notable ornament to the “club block” on Forty Fourth Street, which already has several of the finest club and hotel buildings in the metropolis.26

The design was also covered in *American Architect & Building News, The Architectural Review, Architects’ and Builders’ Magazine*, and *The Brickbuilder*.

The original 11-story Yale Club building, of steel-frame skeleton construction, has a 50-foot-wide front façade that features a double-story rusticated limestone base and red brick cladding laid in Flemish bond (with glazed headers) above, balconies, a profusion of ornamental terra-cotta details (with neo-Classical, Greek, and Secessionist references) and an oversized arch surmounted by a cartouche above the widely-projecting bracketed copper cornice. The terra cotta was manufactured by the New York Architectural Terra Cotta Co.27 The original design also had dates, inscriptions, and ornament referring to Yale University and the State of Connecticut (most of these motifs have since been covered or removed). Its tripartite composition reflected the original internal organization. The two-story base consisted of club rooms, with ground-story lobby and reception, smoking, grill, and billiard rooms, and second-story library and lounging room. The third through eighth stories contained ten bachelor apartments per story. The upper portion had class and private dining rooms, a council room, and a bar on the ninth story; the main dining room on the tenth story; and the kitchen and serving rooms on the eleventh story (there was also a planned roof garden area).

By 1912, however, with a Yale Club membership of some 3,250, the *Times* reported that “for nearly two years its accommodations have been too small for the large membership, and the prospect of removal has been discussed informally for some time,”28 and the club found a new site in the “New York Central track yard improvement district.” It moved into its new 21-story tower clubhouse (1913-15, James Gamble Rogers), 50 Vanderbilt Avenue (at 44th Street) facing Grand Central Terminal, with the intention of making it a national center for Yale alumni.
Tracy & Swartwout, Architect

Tracy & Swartwout was formed in 1900 by Evarts Tracy (1869-1922) and Egerton Swartwout (1871-1943), both alumni of Yale University, members of the Yale Club, and former draftsmen in the office of McKim, Mead & White. Swartwout was born in Indiana and graduated from Yale in 1891, working for McKim, Mead & White until he joined with Tracy. Born in New York, Tracy graduated from Yale in 1890, attended the Ecole des Beaux-Arts in 1892-94, and worked for McKim, Mead & White in 1890-95, with George A. Ballantine in 1896, and with H. VanBuren Magonigle in 1897-99. The Yale Club of New York City Building appears to have been Tracy & Swartwout’s first commission. From about 1904 to 1909, they were joined by James Riely Gordon (1863-1937), and the firm of Gordon, Tracy & Swartwout achieved prominence with a number of public buildings across the United States. Gordon, born in Virginia and educated in Texas, worked for his civil engineer father and for a railroad, then spent seventeen years as a draftsman and supervising architect in the office of the U.S. Supervising Architect in Washington. He designed the Arizona Capitol (1899-1900) and, independently and with his partners, designed some 72 courthouses. From about 1909 to 1912, the firm was Tracy, Swartwout & Litchfield, with Electus Darwin Litchfield (1872-1952), a graduate of the Stevens Institute of Technology, who had worked in the offices of Carrere & Hastings and Lord & Hewlett. Among the buildings designed by the various incarnations of Tracy & Swartwout were: the Hotel Webster (1902), 40 West 45th Street; Connecticut Savings Bank (1906), New Haven; Home Club (1906-08, demolished), 15 East 45th Street; National Metropolitan Bank (1907), Washington, D.C.; U.S. Post Office/Courthouse (1908-14), Denver; the facade of the 107-109 Riverside Drive rowhouse (1910-11); Cathedral of St. John’s in the Wilderness (Episcopal), Denver; Dept. of Commerce Building (1912), Washington, D.C.; Missouri Capitol (1913-18), Jefferson City; and Town Hall (1916-19), Milford, Conn.

During World War I, Evarts Tracy served in the Engineering Corps, rising to Lieutenant-Colonel, then as an instructor on Governors Island; he returned to France to assist in reconstruction, until his death in Paris in 1922. The firm of Tracy & Swartwout continued until Tracy’s death, after which Swartwout continued to practice until 1941, designing mainly in a grand neo-Classical style. He was responsible for the National Baptist Memorial Church (1922-24), Washington, D.C.; Elks National Memorial (1923-26), Chicago; Art Gallery (1927-28), Yale University; and Municipal Auditorium (1928), Macon, Ga. Swartwout was awarded the Gold Medal of the American Institute of Architects (1920) and served three terms as president of the New York chapter.

The Builder

The construction firm of Marc Eidlitz & Son, known for its high-quality work, was responsible for many notable commercial and institutional buildings and skyscrapers, as well as private residences of the wealthy in New York City. Marc Eidlitz (1826-1892), born in Prague, Bohemia, emigrated to New York in 1847, was apprenticed to a mason/builder, and started his own building firm in 1854. He was the brother of the noted architect Leopold Eidlitz and the uncle of architect Cyrus L.W. Eidlitz, Leopold’s son. Marc Eidlitz’s firm built such important structures as the Metropolitan Opera House, Steinway Hall, Astor Library addition, Lord & Taylor, Broadway Tabernacle, Presbyterian and German Hospitals, and the residences of J.P. Morgan and Ogden Goelet. Eidlitz is said to have “practically retired” from the firm in 1888, becoming
president of the Germania Bank, and upon his death in 1892, his son Otto Marc Eidlitz (1860-1928), became president of the construction company, a position he held until his death. Otto Eidlitz had received civil engineering degrees from Cornell University in 1881 and 1890, entering his father’s business after the first, and was made a partner in 1884. Robert James Eidlitz, his brother, was educated as an architect at the Royal Polytechnic in Berlin and began working in the firm in 1889. Among the later buildings constructed by the firm in New York were the St. Regis Hotel, B. Altman’s, Arnold Constable & Co., Empire Building, J.P. Morgan Building on Wall Street, American Telephone & Telegraph Building (130 Broadway), and Bankers’ Trust Co. Building (14 Wall Street).³⁴

The Delta Kappa Epsilon Club and Headquarters³⁵

The former Yale Club building was next owned (1916-25) by the Delta Kappa Epsilon fraternity, through the D.K.E. Holding Corp., and used as a club and headquarters. Delta Kappa Epsilon had been founded at Yale University in 1844, and by 1916 had 43 chapters and 35 American alumni associations, with over 13,000 members, but no central location. In July 1916, the Times announced that “about $100,000 will be spent in alterations and new equipment, bringing the total investment up to about $500,000.”³⁶ The club opened in January 1917 after a $75,000 renovation, which included alteration of the main and basement entrances and steps, as well as the addition of a rooftop penthouse with squash courts and locker rooms (Oswald C. Hering and Douglas Fitch, architects). There were 70 bedrooms in the structure. In August 1925, Delta Kappa Epsilon purchased No. 5 East 51st Street, and subsequently moved.

The Army & Navy Club of America³⁷

The former Yale Club property was acquired in October 1925 by the Army & Navy Club of America, one of the oldest American military clubs. In 1885, after officers of the Army, Navy, and New York National Guard held a dinner at Martinelli’s restaurant, Fifth Avenue and 19th Street, a club was organized informally as “The Canteen.” It was incorporated in 1889 as the United Service Club in the City of New York, and later in 1897 as the Army & Navy Club of New York;³⁸ the name was changed again in 1921 to Army & Navy Club of America. Prohibition (1919-33) was a significant factor negatively affecting the incomes of New York clubs, and by June 1933, the membership of the Army & Navy Club had declined to about 500. The Depression-era reduction in the incomes of members further resulted in the club’s inability to collect some $40,000 in dues, causing it to file for bankruptcy. The United States Trust Co. sued to foreclose on the $312,000 mortgage, and the Army & Navy Club was closed. An auction was held in September 1933, the building was sold for $200,000 and transferred in October to the U.S. Trust Co., but a deficiency judgment was filed against the club for $136,000 in November; it was transferred to Thirty West Forty-fourth Street Corp. in December. Two years later, in 1935, it was announced that the owners had leased the building for conversion into a clubhouse for men and women (this plan did not proceed). In 1939, there was another planned purchase for conversion into an apartment house for $250,000, and the New York Times printed a rendering indicating that architects Charles and Selig Whinston’s “modernization” would have stripped the building of its ornament. Instead, it was sold at auction in November 1942, and acquired by Harry S. and Morris Ginsberg (of Flushing)³⁹ for $17,000, subject to the mortgage and $23,000 in taxes.
U.S. Maritime Service Center/ U.S. Army Organized Reserve Corps Headquarters

The United States Government purchased the building from the Ginsbergs in December 1943, and it was opened in June 1944 for use during World War II as the U.S. Maritime Service Center. This was the home of its graduate station, that assigned graduates of the Sheepshead Bay and Hoffman Island training centers to their first ships; the U.S.M.S. Institute and its correspondence schools; the Shore Patrol; a recreation center; and “berthing compartments” for up to 200 seamen awaiting orders. By 1947, the Civilian Naval Reserve Center was listed here. The building in December 1947 became the consolidated center of Manhattan units of the U.S. Army Organized Reserve Corps (previously scattered in a number of buildings), which was composed of civilian soldiers (including active affiliated and non-affiliated units, and others yet to be activated), with facilities needed for training in preparation of field exercises. Opened in April 1948, there was a first-story lounge and mess/snack bar; second-story conference rooms; third-story Adjutant General and Ordinance units; fourth-story Quartermaster and Coast Artillery units; fifth-story Military Intelligence, Armored Cavalry, and Staff Administration; sixth-story Chemical Service, non-Divisional Infantry units, Signal Corps, and Military Police; seventh- and eighth-story Engineer Corps, 22nd Field Artillery units; ninth-story Medical, Hospital and Transportation offices; and tenth- and eleventh-story 77th Infantry (Liberty) Division. In 1951, seven floors of the structure were turned over to the new Organized Reserve Corps School Center. The New York Times in 1953 called the “Army Reserve School” one of the largest in the U.S., stating that the school’s purpose was to increase military proficiency for some 700 Reserves members – mainly officer reservists, but discretionary admission was also given to enlisted men. City directories listed this building as the New York office (1959-65) of John V. Lindsay, during his term as U.S. Congressman (he served as Mayor of New York from 1966 to 1973). Around the same time, it was also home of the Army Relief Society, which assisted widows and provided scholarships for dependent children.

Touro College

Determined “surplus property,” the former Yale Club building was donated by the U.S. Government in January 1971 to Touro College, called by the Times “a new nonsectarian liberal arts college that will stress the Jewish heritage, western humanities and the sciences in its curriculum,” with a conservative political orientation and named for Judah Touro (1775-1854), a Jewish American philanthropist. An advertisement later that year indicated that the college was for men only. The ill-starred institution soon became embroiled in a number of scandals. In 1974, it planned to open a law school, but the following year a number of major donations were withheld or withdrawn when its reputation became tainted. Eugene Hollander, chairman of Touro’s Board of Trustees, who owned a number of nursing homes then under investigation, was indicted and ultimately convicted for stealing Medicaid and Medicare funds. The college itself fell under state and federal investigation in 1976 for establishing questionable programs in order to obtain state and federal tuition grants; the State Education Department in 1977 found that Touro “operated unregistered programs and that there were deficiencies in some special programs that had approval,” and was asked to return some $822,000 in tuition-aid funding. The former bursar of the college was indicted for embezzling $600,000 in 1980. Despite its problems during this period, Touro College exists today, with a main campus in Manhattan.
The Penn Club of New York

In 1989, the property was acquired by the Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania after the $15 million sale was approved by the U.S. Dept. of Education, with the stipulation that the government be paid $450,000 by Touro College. After fundraising of around $25 million, renovation of the building into the Penn Club of New York occurred in 1992-94, including a three-story rooftop addition clad in brick and limestone, by [David P.] Helpern Architects. The firm was given a Preservation Award for this work by the Municipal Art Society of New York in 1995.

The New York Alumni Society, the first University of Pennsylvania alumni group outside of Philadelphia, was formed in 1886 at Delmonico’s. The club was later chartered and in 1901, the University of Pennsylvania’s Club of New York opened in ground-story rooms of the Hotel Royalton. For most of its history, the club has moved constantly and shared or inhabited other clubs’ quarters. After a period (1905-10) in the Hotel Stanley, the club attempted periodically to find a new clubhouse, but this effort was interrupted by World War I. In 1920, it purchased the former Home Club, 15 East 45th Street, and the adjacent property at 12-14 East 46th Street, but was housed (1922-35) at No. 35-37 East 50th Street. In 1935-38, it shared the Cornell Club, 22 East 38th Street, then was in Satterlee House, 37 East 36th Street. In 1939-61, the Penn Club was in the Phi Gamma Delta Club, 106 West 56th Street, and in 1964-66 was at the Biltmore Hotel, Madison Avenue and 45th Street. For the next three decades, Penn alumni wanting to join a club became associate members of the Princeton Club, 15 West 43rd Street (located here since 1963), which along with the Cornell Club (1989), 6 East 44th Street, were late arrivals to clubhouse row.

Description

The 50-foot-wide, Beaux-Arts style Yale Club of New York City Building (1900-01) was originally 11 stories; three upper stories were added in 1992-94 by [David P.] Helpern Architects. Base: The two-story, three-bay base of the building is clad in rusticated limestone above a granite watertable. The central entrance has a bossed surround surmounted by a bracketed decorative molded entablature (which was originally surmounted by a cartouche bearing the Yale University shield flanked by foliation and anthemia, removed c. 1939-47). Originally there was an areaway with metal railings (removed 1916). The entrance is approached by granite steps flanked by granite cheekwalls and a granite threshold in the outer vestibule (the cheekwalls and steps were reduced in depth 1916); curved metal railings, decorative metal lampposts and a sidewalk awning were installed (1992-94). The original double metal entrance doors were later replaced by double metal-and-glass doors with decorative metalwork and a transom. The outer vestibule has side metal grilles; a decorative metal screen was placed at the top of the opening (1992-94). Originally there was a basement doorway in the eastern bay (altered pre-1979) and a basement window in the western bay, with windows above each (with one-over-one wood sash); on both bays the basement and first-story openings were joined (1992-94) and have metal doors surmounted by pediments (with light fixtures) and metal screens. These doorway openings have voussoirs surmounted by panels decorated with plain disks flanked by foliation. The central second-story bay is a multi-pane window group with its original metal framing having a bracketed central pediment decorated with anthemia and a band decorated with bosses, and pivot sash. This window group is flanked by Ionic combination pilaster-half columns supporting a plaque (that originally bore a Yale Club inscription, now covered). Flagpoles were installed on either side of the central bay (1992-94). The
outer second-story windows (with original double pivot sash) have voussoirs surmounted by plaques (originally bearing the dates MDCCCXCVII and MDCCCCI, now covered) flanked by swags, which are surmounted by bands decorated with bosses. The base is terminated by a molded and denticulated cornice.

**Midsection:** The four-bay midsection is clad in red brick laid in Flemish bond (with glazed headers) with terra-cotta ornamental details. One-over-one sash were originally wood (now metal). The third-story central bays are flanked by decorative panels surmounted by a pierced balcony supported by large foliated brackets; the outer bays have paneled pilasters that support corbeled pediments decorated with anthemia, and are flanked by disks (originally bearing Yale-related letters and ornament, now plain) and ornamental bands. The fourth- through the seventh-story windows have brick voussoirs and terra-cotta keystones. The outer bays of the seventh story are surmounted by pierced balconies supported by large foliated brackets with lions’ heads. The eighth-story windows have terra-cotta lintels with foliated cartouches (the large central one originally bore “Y” for Yale, now covered). A large flagpole was originally located atop the sixth story. The midsection is terminated by a molded terra-cotta cornice.

**Upper Portion:** The ninth story has small windows (with one-over-one sash) flanked by two central fluted pilasters and by panels decorated with plain disks and foliation; the story is terminated by a widely-projecting coffered and modillioned copper cornice decorated with lions’ heads, supported by large foliated brackets, which in turn supports a balcony decorated with panels and balusters. The tenth story has two outer windows (with one-over-one sash) flanked by terra-cotta pilasters and brick panels supporting a molded cornice. The central tenth-story bay has an oversized molded central arch (which originally bore the Connecticut state motto “Qui transtulit sustinet” [“He who transplanted still sustains”], now covered) surmounted by a foliated cartouche with the Connecticut state shield; within the arch is a tripartite window group with pilasters and a large divided fanlight. The 11th story is a standing-seam copper-clad mansard roof pierced by windows (originally double pivot, now single-pane). The set-back 12th through 14th stories (1992-94) are clad in brick and limestone and have windows. The 12th story, terminated by a balustrade, has a curved central section that is decorated with the University of Pennsylvania shield.

**Rear Facade:** The portion of the rear facade visible from West 43rd Street consists of the upper portion of the original building and the 1992-94 addition, both unarticulated, clad in red brick, and pierced by windows and louvers, with four metal ventilating shafts. Two air-conditioning condensers and a water tower are located on the roof.

Report researched and written by
Jay Shockley
Research Department

---

**NOTES**


2. The Library is a designated New York City Landmark.


7. Chudacoff, 247.


10. Chudacoff, 4. Historian Gwendolyn Wright, in *Building the Dream: A Social History of Housing in America* (Cambridge: MIT Pr., 1981), 141, similarly observed that the presence of unmarried women in hotels was even more controversial, “since it was considered a grave threat when women abandoned domesticity.”


13. The Gorham is a designated New York City Landmark.


17. “Bachelor Apartment Houses,” *Real Estate Record & Builders Guide*, Jan. 21, 1905, 131. One notable early example is the Wilbraham (1888-90, D[avid]. & J[ohn]. Jardine), 1 West 30th Street (aka 282-284 Fifth Avenue), which catered to single professional men of means, and today is a designated New York City Landmark.


19. Financing would be provided by a $200,000 mortgage, plus stock subscriptions of $175,000, of which $56,000 had been already subscribed.


21. “Yale Club Meeting.”


27. The Brickbuilder (Sept. 1900), 197. The New York Architectural Terra Cotta Co. was established in 1886 by Orlando B. Potter (with Asahel Clarke Geer) after his experience in the construction of his Potter Building (1883-86, Norris G. Starkweather), 35-38 Park Row, which used extensive architectural terra cotta. The only major architectural terra cotta firm in New York City, it became one of the largest such American manufacturers, producing ornament for such notable structures as Carnegie Hall (1889-91, William B. Tuthill), Montauk Club (1889-91, Francis H. Kimball), West End Collegiate Church and School (1892-93, Robert W. Gibson), Ansonia Hotel (1889-1904, Paul E.M. Duboy), and Plaza Hotel (1905-07, Henry Hardenbergh). The Montauk Club is located within the Park Slope Historic District; the other buildings are all designated New York City Landmarks.


30. This house is a designated New York City Landmark.


32. The Astor Library is a designated New York City Landmark and the Lord & Taylor building is within the Ladies’ Mile Historic District.


34. The St. Regis Hotel, B. Altman’s, J.P. Morgan, Empire, and Bankers’ Trust Co. buildings are designated New York City Landmarks.


38. Previous club locations were: 44 West 28th Street; 37 West 31st Street; 16 West 31st Street; 107-109 West 43rd Street; Republican Club; 18 Gramercy Park (former Columbia University Club); and 112 Central Park South (former German Club).

39. These were apparently two brothers who were sons of Hyman Ginsberg, owner of D. Ginsberg & Co., manufacturer of doors, sash, and wood trim. Harry went into real estate, while Morris took over his father’s business and owned the former Fitzgerald House, 145-15 Bayside Avenue, Flushing, which is today a designated New York City Landmark.


43. “Touro College Faces Loss of State Funds.”

FINDINGS AND DESIGNATION

On the basis of a careful consideration of the history, the architecture, and other features of this building, the Landmarks Preservation Commission finds that the (former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York) has a special character and a special historical and aesthetic interest and value as part of the development, heritage, and cultural characteristics of New York City.

The Commission further finds that, among its important qualities, the former Yale Club of New York City Building is located along “clubhouse row,” West 44th Street between Fifth and Sixth Avenues, its neighbors including the Harvard Club, New York Yacht Club, Association of the Bar of the City of New York, and former City Club; that this Beaux-Arts style building, constructed in 1900-01 by builder Marc Eidlitz & Son, was designed by [Evarts] Tracy & [Egerton] Swartwout, both Yale University graduates, Yale Club members, and former employees of McKim, Mead & White, and was one of the first high-rise clubhouse buildings in the city, with over half the floors devoted to bachelor apartments, during the era when bachelor apartment hotels were a necessity in the vicinity; that the original 11-story, 50-foot-wide front façade features a double-story rusticated limestone base and red brick cladding laid in Flemish bond (with glazed headers) above, balconies, a profusion of terra-cotta ornament (manufactured by the New York Architectural Terra Cotta Co.), and an oversize arch surmounted by a cartouche above the widely-projecting bracketed copper cornice, and that its tripartite composition reflected the original internal organization, with club rooms on the lower stories, bachelor apartments in the middle section, and upper club dining rooms and service area; that, organized in 1897, the Yale Club of New York City remained here until 1915, when it moved to a larger facility two blocks east; that this structure was next owned (1916-25) by Delta Kappa Epsilon, a fraternity founded at Yale, and used as a club and headquarters, the Army & Navy Club of America was located here from 1925 until its bankruptcy in 1933, the building remained vacant until it was acquired by the U. S. Government in 1943, it served as the Maritime Service Center during World War II, and after 1948 as headquarters of the U.S. Army Organized Reserve Corps, and it was donated as “surplus property” to Touro College in 1971; and that it was acquired by the Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania in 1989 and has been the home since 1994 of the Penn Club of New York, which added three upper stories by [David P.] Helpern Architects.

Accordingly, pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 74, Section 3020 of the Charter of the City of New York and Chapter 3 of Title 25 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission designates as a Landmark the (former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York), 30-32 West 44th Street, Borough of Manhattan, and designates Manhattan Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 54, as its Landmark Site.

Robert B. Tierney, Chair; Pablo E. Vengochea, Vice Chair
Stephen F. Byrns, Diana Chapin, Joan Gerner, Roberta Brandes Gratz, Christopher Moore, Margery Perlmutter, Roberta Washington, Commissioners
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)
30-32 West 44th Street, Manhattan; Block 1259, Lot 54

Photo: Christopher D. Brazee, 2009
Yale Club of New York City Building

Source: The Brickbuilder (March 1901)
Yale Club of New York City Building

Source: The Architectural Review (Sept. 1900)
Yale Club of New York City Building

Source: Marc Eidlitz & Son 1854-1904 (1904)
Yale Club of New York City Building

Source: American Architect & Building News (July 13, 1901)
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)

*Photo:* Landmarks Preservation Commission, 1979
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)

Photo: Theresa Noonan, 2009
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)

*Photo:  Christopher D. Brazee, 2010*
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)
Upper portion and third-story detail

*Photos: Christopher D. Brazee, 2009 and 2010*
(Former) Yale Club of New York City Building (now Penn Club of New York)
Upper portion with addition of 1992-94

Photo: Helpern Architects, 1995
(FORMER) YALE CLUB OF NEW YORK CITY BUILDING (NOW PENN CLUB OF NEW YORK) (LP-2379), 30-32 West 44 Street. Landmark Site: Borough of Manhattan Tax Map Block 1259, Lot 54.

Designated: February 9, 2010